# HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT

# High Park Alhambra Church

Redevelopment for Residential Uses

260 & 248 High Park Avenue, Toronto, Ontario



#### **PREPARED FOR:**

TRAC Developments Inc. c/o MCG Consultants 500 Rathburn Rd. Etobicoke ON M9C 3S8 416-495-6892

### **PREPARED BY:**

ERA Architects Inc. 10 St. Mary Street, Suite 801 Toronto, Ontario M4Y 1P9 416-963-4497

 Project:
 15-213-01

 Prepared By:
 PE / JF / SI / GB

Issued: February 10, 2016



# CONTENTS

EXEC	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY III			
1	INTR	ODUCTION	1	
	1.1	Scope of the Report		
	1.2	Site Location and Description		
	1.3	Existing Heritage Recognition, 260 High Park		
	1.4	Existing Heritage Recognition, 248 High Park		
	1.5	Adjacent & Nearby Heritage Properties		
	1.6	Present Owner Contact		
2	BACK	GROUND RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS	7	
	2.1	Context		
	2.2	Site History		
	2.3	Church History		
	2.4	Denominational History		
	2.5	Activities of the Church		
	2.6	Design		
3	ASSE	SSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE	31	
	3.1	Assessment for 260 High Park		
	3.2	Assessment for 248 High Park		
	3.3	Draft Statement of Significance for 260 High Park		
4	ASSESSMENT OF EXISTING CONDITION		36	
	4.1	General		
	4.2	Exterior Masonry		
	4.3	Windows		
	4.4	Doors		
	4.5	Exterior and Egress Stairs		
	4.6	Interior		
5	DESC	RIPTION OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT	45	
	5.1	General		
	5.2	Exterior		
	5.3	Interior		
	5.4	Landscape		
	5.5	Uses		Cover Image:
				High Park United
				Church c. 1954 (Toronto Public
Conti	nued on fo	llowing page.		Library).

6	ASSESSMENT OF DEVELOPMENT OR SITE ALTERATION			
	6.1	Impacts of the Proposed Development		
	6.2	Impact on Heritage Attributes of 260 High Park		
7	CONSID	56		
	7.1	Considered Alternatives		
	7.2	Mitigation Strategies		
	7.3	Further Mitigation Potential		
8	CONSERVATION STRATEGY		58	
	8.1	Conservation Approach		
	8.2	Conservation Strategy		
	8.3	Conservation Scope of Work		
9	CONCLUSION		60	
10	PROJECT PERSONNEL		61	
11	APPENDICES		62	
	Appendix I: Listing on the City of Toronto Heritage Register			
	Appendix II: Designation By-law 30-2011 for 200 Annette Street			
	Appendix III: Designation By-law 0215-2009 for 152 Annette Street			
	Appendix IV: Description of Burke, Horwood and White (the Canadian Encyclopedia)			
	Appendi	x V: By-law No. 23-75		

ii

# **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This report has been prepared for the City of Toronto further to a site plan application for the redevelopment of High Park Alhambra Church, located at 260 High Park Avenue, which is listed on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register. The site includes the property to the south at 248 High Park, which contains a two storey house. According to the previous owner, faith groups that were interested in purchasing the building found the cost of required conservation work prohibitive. Therefore, its continued use as a place of worship is no longer viable. In accordance with the Ontario Toolkit *Heritage Places of Worship*, the building was sold for adaptive reuse as a preferable approach over mothballing, relocation, or demolition.

The proposed development seeks to repurpose the site for residential uses while retaining the existing church building. The site is located in an evolving institutional corridor, where two other nearby churches have been conserved through adaptive reuse for residential purposes.

This report finds that the proposed development aims to respect the significant heritage fabric on the site while activating it with a compatible use, based on an evaluation of:

### A) Heritage resources effected and their condition:

- The main church building, constructed in 1907-08;
- The Sunday School addition, constructed in 1924; and
- The use of the building and building grounds as a gathering space for diverse communitybuilding purposes including worship, educational, social, and physical well-being uses.

**B) Proposed development:** a four-storey addition to the retained existing church building in place of the Sunday School addition.

**C) Impact of proposed development on heritage resources**: The original church building will be retained and reused. The church interior will be replaced with residential infill. The Sunday School addition will be removed. The site will no longer be used for community-building purposes.

### D) Measures to mitigate heritage impacts include:

(i) **Preserving the original church building** will maintain the building's visual relationship to the other churches along Annette Street;

- (ii) Maintaining the streetwall along Annette Street;
- (iii) Ensuring that new construction is **distinguishable from** the retained church building;
- (iv) Salvaging interior elements for reuse on site as well as off site; and
- (v) Recording the existing building complex prior to demolition of the Sunday School.

**E)** Conservation strategy: To conserve the church by adapting and reusing it with a contemporary addition, which endeavours to have limited impact on the surrounding established residential neighborhood.

# E 8 A

# **1 INTRODUCTION**

# 1.1 Scope of the Report

This Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) has been prepared by ERA Architects to assess the impact of the proposed development on the heritage resources of High Park Alhambra Church (260 High Park Avenue).

The purpose of an HIA, according to the 2010 City of Toronto's Heritage Impact Assessment Terms of Reference, is to evaluate the proposed development in relation to cultural heritage resources and recommend an overall approach to the conservation of the heritage value of these resources.

This report was prepared with reference to the City of Toronto Terms of Reference for Heritage Impact Assessments (2010), Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, the Ontario Heritage Tool Kit, the Parks Canada Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, the Province of Ontario's 2014 Provincial Policy Statement, and the Ontario Heritage Act.



1. High Park Alhambra Church (ERA, 2015).

### 1.2 Site Location and Description

This property is located on the south-west corner of Annette Street and High Park Avenue in a residential area. It is serviced by two bus line routes, connecting it to Jane, High Park, and Dupont subway stations.

The site contains High Park Alhambra Church, a listed building constructed in 1907-08 with a 1924 addition, and a house constructed in 1935-36.





2. Aerial photograph with subject site outlined in red (Bing Maps, annotations by ERA).

3. Subject site outlined in red on the property data map (City of Toronto, annotations by ERA).



4. 248 High Park Avenue (ERA, 2015).

E B A

# 260 High Park Elevations



5. North elevation, east half (ERA, 2015).



6. North elevation, west half (ERA, 2015).



7. West elevation (ERA, 2015).



8. East elevation (ERA, 2015).



9. South elevation, west half (ERA, 2015).



10. South elevation, east half (ERA, 2015).

# 1.3 Existing Heritage Recognition, 260 High Park

### Heritage Listing

High Park Alhambra Church was listed on the City of Toronto Heritage Register on November 13, 1990. The listing details describe the property as:

High Park Alhambra Church (formerly known as High Park Avenue Methodist Church); 1907-08; Sunday School Building; 1924, Burke, Horwood and White, architects adopted by City Council on November 12 & 13, 1990

See Appendix I for a copy of the heritage listing.

### Reasons for Designation, Annette Street Baptist Church

Annette Street Baptist Church, at 200 Annette Street, was designated under By-law 30-2011 (see Appendix II). The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value states:

Contextually, as a church placed on a corner lot at a major intersection in the neighbourhood, Annette Street Baptist Church is a landmark in the West Toronto community. It is an integral part of **the collection** of churches that contributes to the character of Annette Street as an institutional corridor where Annette Street Baptist Church is historically, visually and physically linked to its surroundings.

[Emphasis added by ERA]

High Park Alhambra is located within the collection of churches referenced above.

4

# Reasons for Designation, Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church

High Park Alhambra Church is also referenced in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value for the former Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church, at 152 Annette Street, (designated under By-law 0215-2009):

Contextually, Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church is a neighbourhood landmark at the northwest corner of Annette Street and Medland Street in West Toronto. It contributes to Annette Street where **a series of church complexes line the boulevard**. Among the group, Keele Street Church of Christ (1890) at 99 Annette, Annette Street Baptist Church (1888) at 200 Annette, and **High Park-Alhambra United Church (1908) at 260 High Park Avenue (at the southwest corner of Annette Street)** are also recognized on the City's heritage inventory.

[Emphasis added by ERA]

See Appendix III for a copy of the designation By-law.

High Park Alhambra is considered an integral component of the institutional corridor of churches along Annette Street.

# 1.4 Existing Heritage Recognition, 248 High Park

There is no existing heritage recognition for 248 High Park.

### 1.5 Adjacent & Nearby Heritage Properties

There are no adjacent\* heritage sites on High Park Avenue or Quebec Avenue.

The Annette Street Baptist Church, kitty-corner to the subject site, is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act under By-law 30-2011.

### 1.6 Present Owner Contact

C/o Mike Giamou TRAC Developments Inc. c/o MCG Consultants 500 Rathburn Rd. Etobicoke, ON M9C 3S8 416-495-6892 mike@mcgconsultants.ca \*Under City of Toronto Official Plan Amendment 199, adjacency refers to:

"Those lands adjoining a property on the Heritage Register and lands that are separated from a property on the Heritage Register by land used as a private or public road, highway, street, lane, trail, right-of-way, walkway, green space, park and/or easement, or intersection of any of these; or, as otherwise defined in a Heritage Conservation District Plan adopted by by-law."

6

# 2 BACKGROUND RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS

### 2.1 Context

### Historical Context

In 1884 the Village of West Toronto Junction was incorporated, due to a real estate boom linked to the Canadian Pacific Rail acquiring two existing rail lines that intersected near Dundas Street West and Keele Street and the subsequent opening of freight rail yard nearby.

By 1889 the village amalgamated with two others - Carlton and Davenport - to form the incorporated Town of West Toronto. Around this time Annette Street became an institutional corridor, including a public library and a masonic temple, and three churches within two city blocks of High Park Methodist Church.

When Victoria Presbyterian Church opened on September 8, 1892, Sunday services at High Park Methodist Church were suspended so that their members could attend the opening services of the neighbouring church. This event was listed as a significant date in the "Autobiography of Our Congregation" (1960).

In 1909 the Town was annexed to Toronto.



11. 1886 Speight & Van Nostrand's map of West Toronto Junction and vicinity, compiled from registered plans and recent surveys, subject site circled in red (Toronto Public Library, annotations by ERA).

# E B A

### Current Context

Of the three permanent church buildings constructed within two blocks of High Park Alhambra United Church, one has continued to function as a church (St. Cecilia's Catholic Church c. 1911) while the two others have been redeveloped into residential condominiums.

Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church, at 152 Annette, was constructed in 1892 and closed in 2006. It served as the community's first high school. Now known as Victoria Lofts, it contains 34 residential units (some of which are housed in an annex to the rear of the church). Before becoming residential it housed a community food bank and offered a homework club, a mom and baby cafe, games and movie nights, first aid and CPR workshops, special concerts, and an open stage night. It is designated under By-law 0215-2009.

Annette Street/Czechoslovakian Baptist Church, at 200 Annette Street, was constructed in 1888 and recently converted into eight townhouses. It is designated under By-law 2011-30.

The surrounding neighbourhood is predominantly residential with some institutional buildings along Annette Street.



12. Churches along Annette Street circled in blue, church on subject site circled in red (Bing Maps).

8

# Churches along Annette Street



13. View east along Annette Street from the west property line of the subject site (ERA, 2015).



14. View west along Annette Street from north side of Medland Street intersection (ERA, 2015).

# Nearby Conversions of Ecclesiastical Buildings



15. Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church, 152 Annette Street, c. 1952 (www.heritagetoronto.org).



16. Victoria Lofts, 152 Annette Street, c. 2015 (ERA, 2015).



17. Annette Street Baptist Church, 200 Annette Street, c. 1890 (Toronto Public Library).



18. Town home conversion, 200 Annette Street, c. 2015 (ERA, 2015).

# View South on High Park



19. View south on High Park Avenue at the intersection of Annette towards the subject site (ERA, 2015).

# 2.2 Site History

The wider site was once a horse racetrack, known as Carlton Park Race Course, which was redeveloped for residential use in the late 19th Century.

The current site was purchased in 1907 for the purposes of constructing a new church building for the High Park Avenue Methodist Church. The new church was completed in 1908.

Over time the property was severed into three lots, including 246, 248, and 260 High Park.

The property at 260 High Park was sold in 2015 to the current owner.



20. 1883 Plan of the subdivision of parts of lots 36, 37, 38 and 39 containing about 240 acres formerly known as Carlton Park Race Course (Toronto Public Library, annotated by ERA).

# E B A

### 2.3 Church History

### Original Wood-Frame Church (1885-1887)

The Bond Street Congregational church planned this church to serve the approximately ten families who lived in this area in 1884. However, the local families asked the official board of Olde Davenport Methodist Church to take over sponsorship of the church, including its construction as well as ministry during the wintertime.

The original church was a wood frame building located on the south-west corner of Annette Street and Quebec Avenue, which was constructed by volunteer labour of local church members and funds from Olde Davenport Methodist Church in 1885. It was known as the Annette Street Church. It had a seating capacity of 300 and 16 Sunday School students.

It was dedicated in September of 1885 by preachers Rev. Dr. Joseph Wild of Bond Street Congregational Church and Rev. Dr. James S. Stone of St. Philip's Anglican Church.

The church was part of the Lambton circuit, three churches that were sponsored by Old Davenport Methodist Church and ministered by the Parkdale Town Hall Mission (except during the wintertime, when roads became impassable).

It was used until the congregation outgrew the space and purchased new land nearby in 1887. This site was sold to the Salvation Army, which later sold it to a lumber company. It is now a residential site. Congregational Church, also known as Independents Church

Congregationalism was a Christian movement originating in 17th century England, which emphasized each individual church as an independent and autonomous unit (thus eliminating bishops and presbyteries). Theologically, it is between Presbyterianism and the Protestantism of Baptists and Quakers. It is unique in its emphasis on the right and responsibility of each congregation to determine its own affairs without the judgement of any higher human authority.

Generally distrustful of state establishment of religion, Congregationalists have worked for civil and religious liberty.

- adapted from Encyclopaedia Britannica



21. An archival photo of the original wood frame church after it had been abandoned and boarded up, after 1887 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).

# Original Brick Church (1887-1924)

In 1887 a new brick church was built on the site of the existing Sunday School addition, at the north-west corner of the lot along Annette Street. It had the capacity to seat 400 and its basement was used as the Sunday School.

In the same year, the congregation became financially independent from Old Davenport Methodist Church.

In 1889 the church was enlarged through an addition of a transept to accommodate a growing congregation. Its seating capacity doubled to accommodate 800 people. It was dedicated in September 1890.

The building was demolished in 1924 to make space for a new, larger Sunday School, which was built as an addition to the new brick church.



22. 1903 Goad's Map, church highlighted red (Toronto Archives, annotations by ERA).

# Original brick church



24. Original brick church with main facade facing towards Annette Street, c. 1888 (Toronto Public Library).



23. Original brick church after expansion, c. 1890 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).



### New Brick Church (1907-Present)

The new church was designed by architects Burke and Horwood. It was constructed in 1907. Its basement, as well as the former church building, were used for Sunday School activities. In 1915 the basement of the new church was renovated to better accommodate the Sunday School activities at the cost of \$1600.

A description of Burke, Horwood and White (White being a later partner) is attached as Appendix IV.



25. 1913 Goad's Map, church property highlighted red (Toronto Archives, annotations by ERA).



Architectural Drawings by Burke & Horwood, 1907

26. Architectural drawing of the east elevation by Burke & Howard, June 20, 1907 (Ontario Archives).



27. Architectural drawing of the north elevation by Burke & Howard, June 20, 1907 (Ontario Archives).





28. High Park United Church with Sunday School addition to the right c. 1954 (Toronto Public Library).



29. High Park United Church with Sunday School addition to the right c. 1960 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).



### Sunday School Addition (1924- Present)

In 1924, the new Sunday School addition was completed. At its opening it had 1,298 Sunday School students. In 1926, the students from Victoria Unionist Sunday School joined High Park United Church's Sunday School. The Sunday School was known as the largest United Sunday School in Canada.

The City of Toronto Heritage Register credits Horwood, Burke, and White with the architectural design of the addition; however, records at the United Church of Canada Archives show that the addition architectural drawings were completed by architect Franklin E. Belfry.

According to the Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada,

BELFRY, Franklin Ernest (1882-1951) was born in Newmarket, Ont. on 8 April 1882 and was educated at the Toronto Technical School. He articled with Beaumont Jarvis (in 1898-1900), then worked in a succession of local Toronto offices for R.M. Ogilvie, J.A. Ellis, G.W. Gouinlock, Bond & Smith, never staying more than a year in each, and finally with Darling & Pearson (in 1908-11). In late 1911 he formed a partnership with James Thomson (see list of works under Thomson & Belfrey), but their collaboration ended in July 1912 when Belfrey accepted the appointment of Architectural Superintendent of the Buildings Dept. of the Toronto Board of Education, taking over from Hiram R. Barber who had held this position in 1909-12. Belfrey worked directly under C.H. Bishop, the Chief Architect of the Board, but Belfrey's signature on drawings and building permit applications indicates that he, not Bishop, likely prepared the plans for many school buildings in Toronto from 1912 to February 1918 when he was succeeded by A.D. Waste. In 1919 Belfrey moved to Ottawa and became staff architect for the Ottawa Housing



30. Burning the mortgage - after it was paid off - November 16, 1945 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).

21

Commission (C.R., xxxv, 27 July 1921, 698). There he was credited with the development of the Linden Lea Community plan and the design of several early houses in that neighbourhood. He was appointed City Architect for Ottawa in July 1921 but by June 1923 he had returned to Toronto and formed a new partnership, this time with Ewart G. Wilson. Within two years he had formed yet another partnership, on this occasion with James A. Ellis, in 1925-27 (see list of works under Ellis & Belfrey). After 1930 Belfrey worked in a number of offices including the drafting department of the Toronto Transit Commission. He died in Toronto on 7 June 1951 (obit. Globe & Mail [Toronto], 8 June 1951, 32; Telegram [Toronto], 8 June 1951, 17)

The majority of his works were public schools in Toronto, with some residential work in Ottawa, railway stations for the Grand Trunk Railway Co, and one other Methodist Church (Donlands Methodist Church constructed in 1923 at Donlands and Furniss Avenues).

# Building Evolution





<sup>31.</sup> Evolution of the church building (ERA, 2015).

### 248 High Park

The original manse house was built in 1911 at 246 High Park Avenue. After it was sold, a new manse house was constructed at 248 High Park.

The second manse house, located at 248 High Park Avenue, was constructed by builder Cecil Stephenson. According to documents for the sale of the building, no deed was ever written up for the house because it was built on church property.

It was sold in 1969 for \$52,000. The proceeds from the sale of the house were to be held in trust for the future purchase of a manse, if needed, and the interest to be used to provide a housing allowance for the minister and other related expenses.

#### Manse House

A manse house is a house provided for a minister of certain Christian Churches, especially the Scottish Presbyterian Church.

- Oxford Dictionary



32. 248 High Park Avenue, c. 1968 (United Church of Canada Archives). Note the Sunday School addition visible to the right.



33. Current condition of the house at 248 High Park Avenue (ERA Architects, 2015). Note the Sunday School addition visible to the right.

# 2.4 Denominational History

The original vision for the first church site was for Congregational church, but it was ultimately constructed as a Methodist Church.

The official union of Methodist, Presbyterian, and Congregational churches took place in June 1925. All 4,797 Methodist congregations entered the union. The congregation voted to join the United Church and the church was renamed the High Park United Church.

Of the 4,512 Presbyterian congregations in Canada, 784 voted to stay out of the union. Approximately half of the congregation of a nearby Presbyterian Church, most recently known as Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church before it closed in 2006, left their church to join High Park United.

In 1970, High Park United Church amalgamated with Alhambra United Church to form High Park Alhambra United Church.

Later the church was renamed High Park Korean United Church.

Note: this HIA refers to the church as High Park Alhambra throughout the document in order to be consistent with the listing on the City of Toronto Heritage Register.

### Methodism

Methodism was an 18th century movement founded by John Wesley, which sought to reform the Church of England from within. However, it became separate from its parent body and developed into an autonomous church.

Methodism is marked by an acceptance of the doctrines of historical Christianity; by an emphasis on doctrines that indicate the power of the Holy Spirit to confirm the faith of believers and to transform their personal lives; by an insistence that the heart of religion lies in a personal relationship with God; by simplicity of worship; by the partnership of ordained ministers and laity in the worship and administration of the church; by a concern for the underprivileged and the improvement of social conditions; and (at least in its British form) by the formation of small groups for mutual encouragement and edification.

- adapted from Encyclopaedia Britannica

# 2.5 Activities of the Church

### Community Service

Church annual reports catalogue the community outreach activities of the church throughout the 20th century. The church was heavily involved in the 1930s Brotherhood Fund, sending assistance to the Prairies during the drought and economic depression.

In the 1950 Annual Report, these activities included:

- Making scrapbooks, gifts, and cards for children at the Hospital for Crippled Children, Utterson Church School of the Muskoka Larger Parish in Huntsville, Weston Sanitorium, the Runnymede Hospital, Sick Children's Hospital, Home for Incurable Children, Runnymede and Queen Elizabeth Hospitals.
- Making 160 calls to check in on "shut-ins", sick, and the elderly in the community. Gift boxes were also sent to many of these community members by the church as well as 256 cards for birthdays, anniversaries, and other special occasions.
- Staging social events at Sunnybrook Hospital for veterans.
- Quilting and clothes-making for the Neighbourhood Worker's Association, Infants Home, and church families in need.

### Social Activities

The church provided numerous opportunities for socializing, which included events for children, gender-specific events, motherspecific events, parent-specific events, and neighbourhood events. Taverns and alcohol were banned in the Junction from 1904-2000; the temperance movement was actively supported by the church community, which included groups specifically organized to protest the opening of any new taverns in Toronto.

In the 1950 Annual Report, the following social activities were listed:



35. Senior Choir c. 1960 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).



34. Members of the Women's Association, c. 1960 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).

- Sixty-Second Girl Guide Company and Seventy-First Boy Scout Group activities;
- Concerts;
- Parties;
- "Ladies Parlors", women-only educational social nights;
- Meals at church;
- Picnics in High Park; and
- Rummage and other fund-raising sales.

### Missions

In 1890-1892 the church sponsored and supervised new missions - the opening of new churches - in nearby communities including Runnymede Road Station, Everest Street Mission, Mission on Royce Avenue east of the CPR tracks. The church also bought a lot at Jane and Richmond Streets, which would later become Humbercrest United Church.

In the 20th century, mission work of the church became international, with missions sponsored to China and India. There were also Canadian missions, including one in Manitoba.



Portrait of the congregation c.
 1890 (Toronto Public Library).



37. Brotherhood Boys, c. 1913 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).



38. Nativity play c. 1960 (High Park Avenue United Church the Autobiography of Our Congregation (1960)).

27

### 2.6 Design

### Church Building, Exterior

The church building is based upon the Gothic Revival-Collegiate Gothic architectural style with a front corner tower massing typology. It has a prominent bell tower at the north-east corner of the site at the intersection of Annette Street and High Park Avenue. It is constructed of brick and stone masonry.

There are two main entrances to the church, which are accessed through the bell tower. There is a secondary entrance on the east facade along High Park Avenue.

The church has matching gables on the north, east, and south facades.

### Sunday School Addition, Exterior

The Sunday School is located to the west of the church structure. It has a gable bay defining the main entrance, which is accessed from the north along Annette Street. There is a second entrance on the south elevation, providing access from the parking lot. It is a standard warehouse form.

A local newspaper described the Sunday School addition as:

(...) erected with a hard red stock brick and trimmed with Bedford lime stone to correspond with the church. The character of architecture follows that of the church in a simplified form suitable for the rectangular shaped plan necessitated by its practical use.

The general plan which has a total area of 20,000 square feet, is a departure in Sunday school work, inasmuch as it provides separate rooms for six individual class spaces and accommodates a total of twelve hundred scholars and teachers. One of the most interesting and useful features is the gymnasium, which has an unobstructed area for basketball, larger than the minimum regulation for league matches. This includes spectators' balcony, dressing rooms and showers. The girls' shower will be in individual dressing cubicles. Kitchenettes are provided on the two upper floors to be used in connection with ladies' work for light supper or afternoon teas.

[...]

The junior department, having the largest room, becomes the assembly room for entertainment purposes, with which can be supplemented another department, which in turn provides space for portable stage and floor area allowing for dramatic work and an audience close to one thousand.

In addition to the other advantages, such as enlarged vestry, choir room, four offices and five lavorities [sic], there are many minor features of a modern nature, such as three fireplaces, light in receptacles for orchestra and remote switches for lantern operators to control lighting system of separate departments and perhaps most important, the spacious corridor leading from all school rooms to the church for general assembly or rally to the entire school.

(Excerpt from United Church of Canada Archives)

### 248 High Park, Exterior

It is a two storey house with a hip roof. The front porch is a later addition. The windows have been replaced within their original openings.

29

### Church and Sunday School, Interior

The interior is a collection of spaces dedicated to worship, office, and recreational or educational uses including the sanctuary, a full size gymnasium, and a hall that can be transformed into multiple rooms using wooden dividers that pull down from the ceiling. There is a maze of hallways and staircases that connect the interior spaces.

### 248 High Park, Interior

The interior was not accessible.

### Landscape

Historically, the grounds of the church have been used for community recreational activities. In the early years the congregation made a skating rink every winter. The skating rink was later replaced with tennis courts. The south area of the property is now paved and was most recently used as parking for the congregation.

There are a number of fences that have been installed around the church. In particular, one fences divides the lawn between the Annette Street and High Park Avenue facades. The fence and plantings in this location obscure the prominence and form of the building.

### Later Designs (Unrealized)

In March of 1974, architects Conforzi & Keen presented their concept for the addition of a seniors' residence to High Park Alhambra Church. Attached to the south elevation of the Sunday School building, it was seven storeys of individual bedroom and washroom units with shared kitchen and living room facilities. The design maintained the church building while removing a portion of the Sunday School addition. Although it was approved, it was never built. See Appendix V for a copy of the 1977 By-law.



39. Sanctuary of High Park United Church c. 1950 (Toronto Archives).



40. Sanctuary of High Park United Church c. 1950 (Toronto Archives).



41. Sanctuary of High Park United Church c. 1950 (Toronto Archives).
# **3 ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE**

## 3.1 Assessment for 260 High Park

The site is not a designated heritage site nor is it within a Heritage Conservation District. The site was assessed by ERA Architects using the Criteria For Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, Ontario Reg. 9/06 made under the Ontario Heritage Act. It is a candidate for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The assessment is summarized below.

Value (quoted from Ontario Reg. 9/06)	Assessment: 260 High Park Avenue, Toronto
1. The property has design value or physical value because it,	The church building is a representative example of an early 20th century neighborhood church and a later Sunday School addition.
i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,	
ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or	
iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	
The property has historical value or associative value because it,	The property is directly associated with the devel- opment of the West Toronto village, the Junction neighborhood, and the Methodist and United Church community. It was a community gathering place for many social practices including Sunday School activities. It is directly associated with the history of religious missions and church-building activities in Toronto, Canada, and abroad.
i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a commu-	
nity or culture, or iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.	The church building demonstrates the work of architects Horwood and Burke. The Sunday School addition demonstrates the work of Frank E. Belfry.
The property has contextual value because it,	The property has contextual value because it is important in defining the institutional corridor of churches along Annette Street in an established residential neighborhood. It is also physically, visually, and historically linked to its surroundings.
i. is important in defining, maintaining or support- ing the character of an area,	
ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or	
iii. is a landmark.	It is a landmark located at the intersection of High Park Avenue and Annette Street.

#### 3.2 Assessment for 248 High Park

The site is not a designated heritage site nor is it within a Heritage Conservation District. The site was assessed by ERA Architects using the Criteria For Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, Ontario Reg. 9/06 made under the Ontario Heritage Act. It was not found to have heritage value or interest, and is not a candidate for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The assessment is summarized below.

Value (quoted from Ontario Reg. 9/06)	Assessment: 248 High Park Avenue, Toronto
1. The property has design value or physical value because it,	Not applicable.
i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,	
ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or	
iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	
The property has historical value or associative value because it,	The property was historically associated with the adjacent church at 260 High Park because it was part of the original property footprint. Its associa- tive value is limited.
i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a commu- nity or culture, or	
<li>iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.</li>	
The property has contextual value because it,	Not applicable.
i. is important in defining, maintaining or support- ing the character of an area,	
ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or	
iii. is a landmark.	

## 3.3 Draft Statement of Significance for 260 High Park

We are not aware of any official Statement of Significance for High Park Alhambra Church.

The following draft Statement of Significance has been prepared by ERA Architects.

## Description

The property at 260 High Park contains a church building and an attached, later Sunday School addition. It is sited on the southwest corner of the intersection of Annette Street and High Park Avenue in the Junction neighbourhood.

## Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

High Park Alhambra Church is an institution of historical importance to the West Toronto Junction Community. Its cultural heritage value is primarily derived from its association with the growth and evolution of its congregation and its contextual relationship with the Junction neighbourhood.

The church has architectural value as a representative example of an early 20th century church and its association with Horwood and Burke is notable.

The site has provided opportunities for education, indoor and outdoor recreational activities, community support groups and social cohesion, and worship space. Beyond its local community, it supported a number of other religious missions in Toronto, across Canada, and abroad in China and India. For example, the church bought a lot at Jane and Richmond Streets, which would later become Humbercrest United Church.

It opened on its first site at the south-west corner of Annette Street and Quebec Avenue, as Annette Street Methodist Church in 1885, a year after the area incorporated as the Village of West Toronto. Due to the need for additional space to house its growing congregation, the church relocated to a new site at the southwest corner of Annette Street and High Park Avenue in 1887. The congregation outgrew the brick church, even after adding a transept in 1889, and a new brick and stone masonry church was constructed on the same site in 1907-08. The new church was designed by architects Horwood & Burke.

The original brick church became the Sunday School, which the congregation quickly outgrew. The Sunday School used the basement of the new church building as overflow space before deciding to replace the original brick church with a new, purposebuilt, Sunday School addition. The addition was designed by architect Franklin E. Belfry and constructed in 1924.

The church is one of four churches along Annette Avenue (between Quebec Avenue and Medland Street), and, along with the library and masonic temple, contributes to the institutional character of the corridor. It provides contextual value as it is historically and visually linked to its surroundings. It is a landmark.

## Heritage Attributes

- The church building's Gothic Revival-Collegiate Gothic style of architecture;
- The materiality of the church, predominantly of brick and stone masonry;
- The placement and setback of the church building on the corner lot;
- The visibility of the bell tower as viewed from the northwest corner of the intersection of Medland and Annette Streets;
- The bell tower, which provides two entrances to the sanctuary (one from Annette Street and one from High Park Avenue);
- The symmetrical gables on the north, east, and south facades of the original church building;

Issued: February 10, 2016

- The stained glass windows of the original church building;
- The sanctuary;
- The institutional character of the site informed by the street wall condition and setbacks along Annette Street; and
- The use of the building complex and its grounds as a community gathering space for diverse activities.

# **4** ASSESSMENT OF EXISTING CONDITION

#### 4.1 General

A visual inspection of the interior and exterior of 260 High Park Avenue was conducted by ERA on December 10th, 2015. The condition of 248 High Park Avenue was not included in this assessment.

The exterior facades were examined from the ground level. The roof was not inspected as part of this condition assessment.

In general, the building is in fair condition. However, the roof is leaking and stairs have become detached. Furthermore, the owners have told us that the boiler is non-functioning.

Two wooden sheds have been added to the west facade of the building and are in poor condition.



42. Wooden shed on the west facade of the building, to the south (ERA, 2015).



43. Wooden shed on the west facade of the building, to the north (ERA, 2015).

#### DEFINITION OF TERMS

The building components were graded using the following assessment system:

*Excellent: Superior aging performance. Functioning as intended; no deterioration observed.* 

Good: Normal Result. Functioning as intended; normal deterioration observed; no maintenance anticipated within the next five years.

Fair: Functioning as intended; Normal deterioration and minor distress observed; maintenance will be required within the next three to five years to maintain functionality.

Poor: Not functioning as intended; significant deterioration and distress observed; maintenance and some repair required within the next year to restore functionality.

Defective: Not functioning as intended; significant deterioration and major distress observed, possible damage to support structure; may present a risk; must be dealt with immediately.

# 4.2 Exterior Masonry

The brick masonry of the church is in poor condition. There are many broken and spalling brick units, especially at ground level. Mortar loss was noted throughout, requiring approximately 50% of brick area to be repointed. Some areas have been repaired, either by replacement of brick units or repointing with a different cementitious mortar.

The stone masonry is in good condition on the church building. Stones from the upper belt of the church have been broken to in order to allow for the installation of the troughs on the south and north facades.

The condition of the west facade of the church building was not reviewed because it is buried within the new Sunday School addition.

The brick masonry on the Sunday School is in good condition. Minor localized brick repairs/replacements and 25% of repointing is necessary.

Pollution stains and efflorescence are visible on both buildings. Organic soiling, climbing vines, and moss on stone and bricks, are mostly located at ground level. Multiple miscellaneous attachments (wires, cables, light fixtures, etc.) to be removed to fit new use of the building.



44. Organic growth on the Sunday School addition (ERA, 2015).

#### 4.3 Windows

The church and Sunday School wood windows with stained lead glazing are original.

In general, the windows are in poor condition, with flaking paint and showing weathered, wood frames.

The stained glass in the church shows vegetal pattern (leaves and acorns) while the Sunday School stained glass windows are rectangular grid pattern. Several windows have broken stained glass. Plastic sheets have been added from the inside for insulation.

Three windows on the church's north facade have been bricked in, while five have been covered with plywood on the north Sunday School facade. On the west facade, 4 windows have been painted over the frame and the glass.

Note that the grade level is higher than original level on the north facade, partially hiding some basement windows.

The metal louver on the upper part of east facade is rusting and in poor condition.

#### 4.4 Doors

The doors on the north and east facades of the church and Sunday School are original but they have been painted over (which is now flaking). Lights have been inserted into the brick archways.

The hardware is in poor condition and rusted. Wood paneling has been replaced with plywood on the south door of the east facade. The Sunday School doors on the east and north facades are in a similar condition. Wooden fire escape doors on the west facade are weathered and are in poor condition.



45. Original windows on the Sunday School (ERA, 2015).



46. Bricked in windows along the north elevation of the church building (ERA, 2015).



47. Painted over main entrance door (ERA, 2015).

# 4.5 Exterior and Egress Stairs

All of the church concrete and brick masonry stairs are in poor condition. Many cracks are visible on the concrete treads and risers. On each side of the stairs, the bricks are spalling and cracking. All entrance stairs need major refurbishment.

The steel exterior emergency exit stairs on the west facade are lightly rusted on the treads. The rest of the structure is in good condition.



48. Entrance stair deterioration (ERA, 2015).

#### 4.6 Interior

#### Church Building

The sanctuary and ancillary spaces are in fair condition. It appears that the lack of activity in the building over an extended period of time has caused the interior to suffer from a lack of maintenance.

The sanctuary is composed of sixteen rows of pews on the ground, organized in a concentric U-shape around a round communion platform. Further west is a platform with a wood pulpit and behind that is the choir seating, which is distinguished by wood arcades with fine millwork details. On both sides of the communion platform there are stairs with wood railings leading up to the gallery. Around the gallery there are wood railings with similar details.

Overall, the wood millwork in the sanctuary is in good condition. There are five more rows of pews on both sides (north and south) of the mezzanine and eight more at the back (east). The pews are in good condition, with the exception of one that has been vandalized and four that are missing at the south-east corner of the sanctuary mezzanine.



49. Stained glass windows, with evidence that a plaque or tablet has been removed from the narthex (ERA, 2015).



50. East elevation of the sanctuary (ERA, 2015).



51. Section looking east , Annette Street Methodist Church, by Horwood & Burke c. 1907 (Ontario Archives).



On top of the arcades, behind the choir, there is a pipe organ that is also part of the original design. The condition of the organ has not been tested as part of ERA site investigation.

The main floor is carpeted. It is in poor condition with joints cracking open and many areas are heavily soiled.

In the choir seating area the floor is wood and in good condition.

The walls of the sanctuary are plaster with moulding details at the corners. Severe damage to the plaster has been observed on columns and window jambs on the north side of the sanctuary at mezzanine level. Plaster has been dissolving and delaminating to expose the concrete structure at those locations. Marks are visible on the plaster where religious artefacts were previously installed at the ground floor level in the narthex area.

It appears that most religious artefacts have been removed from the sanctuary space, with the exception of the stained glass windows containing biblical characters. The ceiling is plaster as well. It is composed of two barrel vaults that meet into a double barrel vault at choir. The vaults rest on columns at exterior walls as well as four interior columns. Plaster moulding accentuates the edges of the vaults. Lighting fixtures are suspended from the ceiling and are in good condition. The plaster is in fair condition. Minor cracks have been observed and require patching and repair.



52. Organ in the sanctuary (ERA, 2015).



53. Front elevation of the organ, Annette Street Methodist Church, by Horwood & Burke c. 1907 (Ontario Archives).

# Original fixtures in good condition



54. Choir panelling, Annette Street Methodist Church, by Horwood & Burke c. 1907 (Ontario Archives).



55. Choir panelling (ERA, 2015).



56. Gallery rail, Annette Street Methodist Church, by Horwood & Burke c. 1907 (Ontario Archives).



57. Gallery rail (ERA, 2015).



58. Ceiling details, Annette Street Methodist Church, by Horwood & Burke c. 1907 (Ontario Archives).



59. Original ceiling in the sanctuary (ERA, 2015).

## Sanctuary areas requiring repair



60. Broken pews and plaster columns (ERA, 2015).



61. Deterioration of the ceiling (ERA, 2015).



62. Window moulding (ERA, 2015).



63. Missing pews in the gallery (ERA, 2015).

#### Sunday School

The interior of the Sunday School is in poor condition. The interior space has been through different eras of renovations and shows a variety of finishes, from carpet to vinyl composite tiles and simple painted plywood board. Cracks in walls are common throughout the building. The lack of maintenance is responsible for the general decay of the interior spaces.

The Sunday School features a below-grade gymnasium space that is in fair condition.

The three original fireplaces are still visible, with the exception of one that has been tiled.

The second floor main room features a wooden room dividing system. On the third floor, wood partitions and interior windows of the main room are present. There are also several original wood frame skylights that have been blocked.



64. Fireplace with original surrounds and hearth (ERA, 2015).



65. Skylight (ERA, 2015).



66. Interior gymnasium (ERA, 2015).



67. Wooden dividers that roll down from the ceiling (ERA, 2015).

# **5 DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT**

#### 5.1 General

The proposed development seeks to repurpose the site for residential uses while retaining the original church building. It includes parking below grade.

The Sunday School addition will be removed and replaced with a new addition. The new addition will be limited to four storeys in height and will wrap around the west and south facades of the church building. The house at 248 High Park Avenue will be removed.

## 5.2 Exterior

The retained facades will be altered to provide outdoor spaces for individual units such as patios and terraces at the ground level and balconies in upper storeys. The proposed terrace at the ground level along the Annette Street elevation will be enclosed with a transparent glass and steel structure.

#### 5.3 Interior

The interior of the church building will be adaptively reused from a sanctuary to residential uses.

Some of the original materials from the interior - including doors, flooring, and wood panelling - will be salvaged for reuse within the proposed development. See Section 7.2 Conservation Strategy for details.

## 5.4 Landscape

Terraces for the residential units will match the existing entry levels. Further amenities related to the new residential use (such as balconies and the glass enclosed terraces) will be constructed alongside the heritage facades.

A new lay-by will be built on High Park Avenue to provide drop-off vehicular access.

# 5.5 Uses

The building has been vacant since its purchase in October 2015. It was formerly used as a place of worship along with recreational and educational community uses. The previous owner sought to maintain the building as a place of worship, but interested faith groups found the cost of conservation work required to maintain the building in good order prohibitive.

The proposed development seeks to introduce residential uses to the site.

## Proposed site plan



ischer Arch

# E B A

High Park Avenue

## Proposed Development



69. Proposed east elevation, along High Park Avenue (Turner Fleischer Architects).



70. Proposed north elevation, along Annette Street (Turner Fleischer Architects).

#### Areas of Retention and Removal





71. Left: Area to be removed (Bing Maps, annotated by ERA).72. Above: North elevation, west half showing cut line (ERA, 2015).



EXISTING FLOOR 1 PLAN

73. Cut line shown on the existing Floor 1 Plan (Turner Fleischer Architects).



74. Pink indicates the new walls of the 1907 church which was built onto the 1887-1889 church building to the west (Ontario Archives).

E B A

# **6** ASSESSMENT OF DEVELOPMENT OR SITE ALTERATION

According to the previous owner, faith groups that were interested in purchasing the building found the cost of required conservation work prohibitive. Therefore, its continued use as a place of worship is no longer viable. In accordance with the Ontario Toolkit *Heritage Places of Worship*, the building was sold for adaptive reuse as a preferable approach over mothballing, relocation, or demolition.

The proposed development can be considered part of the natural evolution of the neighbourhood, as evidenced by the conversion of two nearby former churches - Annette Street Baptist Church and Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church - into residential uses. In these two instances, residential use was found to be a compatible use for a defunct place of worship.

There is a history of building evolution on the site, which includes removal and new construction for the purposes of accommodating the needs of the site. The removal of the Sunday School addition may be a necessary loss in order to achieve a new use on the site. The new, replacement addition should be considered as part of the natural evolution of the site.

#### 6.1 Impacts of the Proposed Development

#### The Sunday School addition

The Sunday School addition will replaced by a contemporary addition. The height and setbacks of the proposed addition is intended to reference the form of the Sunday School. It will be distinguishable from the heritage fabric as per Standard 11 of the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*.

The area of transition between the new construction and the heritage fabric has been addressed by way of a reveal to distinguish between old and new.

## The house at 248 High Park

The removal of the house at 248 High Park is necessary to achieve the new use on the site. Its removal does not represent an impact on adjacent heritage resources (the church).

This represents a reunification of two portions of the original property footprint.

# The church at 260 High Park

Some proposed alterations are visible on the exterior of the main church. In particular, terraces set slightly above grade on the north and east facades. These will nominally alter the appearance of the church from the street.

The glass enclosed terraces in the proposed development will match the setback of the staircase enclosure of the former annex along Annette Street. They will be constructed of transparent glass and steel frames, allowing the facades of the church to remain visible from the public realm. As per Standard 12 of the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*, these new additions will be constructed so that if they are removed in the future the essential form and integrity of the historic place will not be impaired. These may be considered appropriate alterations to meet modern market demands.

New balconies on the north and south elevations will be inset from the existing church windows.

The south facade of the church will remain visible looking west from the public realm, as the proposed development features an open courtyard framed by the church building south elevation and new construction. There will be limited visual and physical impacts to the south facade of the church where planters, two outdoor walkways connecting to the new construction, and balconies are proposed.

The proposed skylights, providing light into the former sanctuary, are considered an alteration of limited impact. This is a common alteration for the adaptive reuse of churches for residential use.

The sanctuary will be rehabilitated for residential use.

#### 6.2.1 Impact Assessment Table

The following table identifies and assesses possible impacts of the proposal on cultural heritage resources. The possible impacts included here are as identified in the Ontario Heritage Tool Kit.

Issue	Assessment
Destruction of any, or part of any, significant heritage attributes or features	The Sunday School addition will be removed and replaced with new construction a new four storey addition. The sanctuary will be infilled with residential development. Some features of the sanctuary, such as the wood panelling, will be salvaged for reuse on and off site where possible. The team is in talks to find a place to donate the pews.
Alteration that is not sympathetic, or is incompatible, with the historic fabric and appearance	The alterations - new entrance vestibules, terraces, patios, and a green house - to the heritage facades may be considered appropriate in order to meet market demands for private amenity spaces. However, they will alter the appearance of the heritage facade and will result in a physical impact. These alterations are reversible.
Shadows created that alter the appearance of a heritage attribute, or change the viability of a natural feature or plantings, such as a garden	See Shadow Study produced by Turner Fleischer.
Isolation of a heritage attribute from its surrounding environment, context or a significant relationship	The visual and historical relationship of the church to other institutional buildings along this segment of Annette Street will be maintained. The new con- struction on the north and east heritage facades will have a limited impact on this relationship.
Direct or indirect obstruction of significant views or vistas within, from, or of built and natural features	Not applicable.
A change in land use such as a battlefield from open space to residential use, allowing new development or site alteration to fill in the formerly open space	There is a change in land use from worship and community space to residential.
Land disturbances such as a change in grade that alters soils, and drainage patterns that adversely affect an archaeological resource	Not applicable.

## 6.2 Impact on Heritage Attributes of 260 High Park

The following is an outline of the impacts on the specific heritage attributes of 260 High Park Alhambra Church that are identified in the Draft Statement of Significance on pages 33-35 of this report.

1. The church building's Gothic Revival-Collegiate Gothic style of architecture. *New additions to the church exterior walls will be distinguishable from the heritage fabric as per Standard 11 of the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada.* 

2. The materiality of the church, predominantly of brick and stone masonry. The material of new additions will be distinguishable from the church. The materiality of the church will remain predominantly of brick and stone masonry.

3. The placement and setback of the church building on the corner lot. *The existing building is remaining in situ*.

4. The visibility of the bell tower as viewed from the north-west corner of the intersection of Medland and Annette Streets. *The proposed development will not interfere with the visibility of the bell tower from the location described*.

5. The bell tower, which provides two entrances to the sanctuary (one from Annette Street and one from High Park Avenue). *The form with two entrances will be retained*.

6. The symmetrical gables on the north, east, and south facades of the original church building. *No impact*.

7. The stained glass windows of the original church building. *The stained glass windows will remain in situ, where possible. Those that cannot be retain in situ will be replaced, where possible.* 

8. The sanctuary. The sanctuary will be infilled with residential development. Some features of the sanctuary, such as the wood panelling, will be salvaged for reuse on and off site. The team is in talks to find a place to donate the pews.

9. The institutional character of the site informed by the street wall condition and setbacks along Annette Street. *The modern amenities for the residential use, including the new addition and private terraces, will impact the institutional character of the building. These may be considered appropriate in order to meet market demands, similar to alterations on other churches that have been rehabilitated for residential use.* 

10. The use of the building complex and its grounds as a community gathering space for diverse activities. *The building complex will be predominantly used for residential units; however, re-using the complex for community-building purposes does not appear to be a viable conservation strategy. See Section 6.* 

## Alterations to the heritage fabric of 260 High Park







75. Proposed building section, new construction highlighted in blue which will be visible looking west towards the church building (Turner Fleischer Architects, highlighted by ERA Architects).

76. Proposed site plan, terraces and greenhouses on the exterior, street-facing facades highlighted in blue (Turner Fleischer Architects, highlighted by ERA Architects).

77. Proposed skylights highlighted in blue (Turner Fleischer Architects, highlighted by ERA Architects).

# 7 CONSIDERED ALTERNATIVES AND MITIGATION

#### 7.1 Considered Alternatives

The considered alternative to the proposed development would be to maintain the status quo. The current conditions, unchanged or with minor modifications, would not conserve the heritage value of the property. Indefinite mothballing is not an appropriate means of conservation. The recent period of disuse has already had a negative impact on the building and the church, in its current state, is not contributing to the community.

## 7.2 Mitigation Strategies

The proposed development mitigates impacts on heritage by:

1. Conserving the original church building and maintaining its visual relationship with the other churches along Annette Street;

2. Maintaining the streetwall on Annette Street by replacing the Sunday School addition with new construction that maintains similar setbacks to the existing complex;

3. Ensuring that the new construction is distinguishable from the retained church building;

4. Salvaging and reusing interior elements including:

- Selected salvageable wood panelling in the Sanctuary will be reused throughout the common amenity areas;
- Selected salvageable doors will be reused both functionally and decoratively throughout the development;
- The wood joists and flooring (where in salvageable condition) will be refurbished and reused in both original locations and new locations such as corridors, and loft floors and ceilings;
- Where possible, the stained glass will be retained and refurbished in its original locations. Where not possible, it will be reused in public areas of the new building, where feasible;
- Where possible, bricks will be salvaged for reuse; and

• The doors of the Annex will be refurbished and refinished for operational use, where possible.

5. Donating the pews and church organ to another place of worship.

6. Recording the existing building complex through measured drawings and photographs, which will be submitted to the City of Toronto Archives as well as the United Church of Canada Archives.

# 7.3 Further Mitigation Potential

Further mitigation measures could include:

1. Prohibiting climbing vines on the site; and

2. Ensuring that any plants adjacent to the church walls be planted in raised planters, in order to prevent root systems from negatively impacting the exterior walls of the church.

# 8 CONSERVATION STRATEGY

#### 8.1 Conservation Approach

The proposed conservation approach for the heritage resources that will remain on the Site is *rehabilitation*. Rehabilitation is defined in Parks Canada's *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places* as "the action or process of making possible a continuing or compatible contemporary use of an historic place ... while protecting its heritage value."

Rehabilitation is the preferred approach when repair or replacement of deteriorated features is necessary and alterations or additions to an historic building are required for a new use.

## 8.2 Conservation Strategy

The goal of conserving heritage places of worship, according to the Ontario Heritage Toolkit *Heritage Places of Worship*, is "to conserve cultural heritage value while keeping heritage places of worship viable as active, evolving and functional spaces".

The conservation strategy for 260 High Park aims to achieve this goal by rehabilitating the church building within a residential development for its long term viable preservation.

The physical and visual impact of the alteration is mitigated by the retention of the original street-facing church facades, material choice for the primary facades of the addition, and limited height of the proposed development. The proposed change will improve the heritage resource's long-term viability.

Note that the condition the west facade of the original church is unknown (it is buried within the Sunday School addition) and may require a heritage mason to remove the later construction and to evaluate its condition.

The existing building complex will be recorded through measured drawings and photographs, which will be submitted to the City of Toronto Archives as well as the United Church of Canada Archives.



78. Wood panelling (ERA, 2015).



79. Doors (ERA, 2015).

An interior artefact assessment of the building should be undertaken in order to ensure all significant elements related to the church building are conserved. Interior building elements will be salvaged for reuse, where possible, in the proposed development.

There may also be an opportunity for interpretation of the historical significance of the site in the form of plaques, public art, or other means.

## 8.3 Conservation Scope of Work

A forthcoming Conservation Plan will describe the conservation work to be completed on the retained facades.



80. Stained glass windows (ERA, 2015).



81. Pews (ERA, 2015).



82. Organ (ERA, 2015).

# 9 CONCLUSION

The proposed development seeks to adaptively reuse the church building for residential purposes. It includes the proposed construction of a four storey condominium, which will wrap around the church building maintaining the visibility of the original south, east, and north facades.

This new, proposed use will secure the conservation of the heritage building. The previous owner had attempted to find faith groups who were able to bear the cost of the required conservation work in order to continue the building's use as a place of worship, but the cost was prohibitive. After exhausting that avenue, it was decided to sell the property for adaptive reuse.

The proposed development aims to respect the significant heritage fabric on the site while activating it with a compatible use.

The church interiors will be replaced with residential infill. The Sunday School addition and the house at 248 High Park Avenue will be removed.

The proposed development generally maintains the visual and historical relationships among the churches along Annette Street and respects the institutional character of the corridor by retaining the north and east heritage facades of the original church building. New construction will be composed of materials that are distinguishable from the heritage fabric.

The loss of a heritage attribute, the change in use, represents a natural evolution that is occurring within the neighbourhood.

# **10 PROJECT PERSONNEL**

Philip Evans

Philip Evans is a principal of ERA Architects and the founder of SMALL. In the course of his fourteen-year career, he has led a range of conservation, adaptive reuse, design, and feasibility planning projects.

Jasmine Frolick

Jasmine Frolick is a planner with ERA Architects. She received her Master of Planning in Urban Development from Ryerson University after completing a Bachelor of Arts at McGill University.

Samantha Irvine

Samantha Irvine works with the heritage planning team at ERA Architects. She has graduate degrees in Historical and Sustainable Architecture (NYU) and Sustainable Urbanism (Wales). Samantha is also a lawyer and member of the Ontario Bar.

Guillaume Brassard

*Guillaume is an architect with ERA Architects. He has a Master of Architecture from Université de Montréal.* 

# **11 APPENDICES**

#### Appendix I: Listing on the City of Toronto Heritage Register

11/10/2015

City of Toronto's Heritage Property Search Detail

Heritage Property Detail

Print Page

Address:	260 HIGH PARK AVE
Ward:	13
Status:	Listed
List Date:	Nov 13, 1990
Intention Date:	
By-Law:	N/A
Part IV Date:	
Part V Date:	
Heritage District:	N/A
District Status:	N/A
Heritage Easement Ag:	
Registration Date:	
Building Type:	Religious
Architect/Builder:	
Construction Yr.:	
Details:	High Park Alhambra Church (formerly known as High Park Avenue Methodist Church; 1907-08; Sunday School Building; 1924, Burke, Horwood and White, architects -adopted by City Council on November 12 & 13, 1990
Demolition Date:	
Primary Address:	260 HIGH PARK AVE
	BACK TO SEARCH RESULT

G City of Toronto 1998- 2015

http://app.toronto.ca/HeritagePreservation/details.do?folderRsn=2435243&propertyRsn=152729

EBA

#### Appendix II: Designation By-law 30-2011 for 200 Annette Street

Authority: Etobicoke York Community Council 39.2, as adopted by City of Toronto Council on August 25, 26 and 27, 2010 Enacted by Council: December 16, 2010

#### CITY OF TORONTO

#### BY-LAW No. 30-2011

#### To designate the property at 200 Annette Street (Annette Street Baptist Church) as being of cultural heritage value or interest.

WHEREAS authority was granted by Council to designate the property at 200 Annette Street (Annette Street Baptist Church) as being of cultural heritage value or interest; and

WHEREAS the *Ontario Heritage Act* authorizes the Council of a municipality to enact by-laws to designate real property, including all buildings and structures located thereon, to be of cultural heritage value or interest; and

WHEREAS the Council of the City of Toronto has caused to be served upon the owners of the land and premises known as 200 Annette Street and upon the Ontario Heritage Trust, a Notice of Intention to designate the property and has caused the Notice of Intention to be posted on the City's web site for a period of 30 days in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 162, Notice, Public, Article II, § 162-4, Notice requirements under the *Ontario Heritage Act*; and

WHEREAS the reasons for designation are set out in Schedule "A" to this by-law; and

WHEREAS no notice of objection was served upon the Clerk of the municipality;

The Council of the City of Toronto HEREBY ENACTS as follows:

- 1. The property at 200 Annette Street, more particularly described in Schedule "B" and shown on Schedule "C" attached to this by-law, is designated as being of cultural heritage value or interest.
- 2. The City Solicitor is authorized to cause a copy of this by-law to be registered against the property described in Schedule "B" to this by-law in the proper Land Registry Office.
- **3.** The City Clerk is authorized to cause a copy of this by-law to be served upon the owners of the property at 200 Annette Street and upon the Ontario Heritage Trust and to cause notice of this by-law to be posted on the City's web site for a period of 30 days in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 162, Notice, Public, Article II, § 162-4, Notice requirements under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

ENACTED AND PASSED this 16th day of December, A.D. 2010.

FRANCES NUNZIATA,

Speaker

ULLI S. WATKISS City Clerk

(Corporate Seal)

2 City of Toronto By-law No. 30-2011

## SCHEDULE "A"

#### **REASONS FOR DESIGNATION**

#### Reasons for Designation (Statement of Significance): 200 Annette Street

#### **Description**

The property at 200 Annette Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for its cultural heritage value, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of design, associative and contextual value. Located on the northeast corner of Annette Street and High Park Ave, Annette Street Baptist Church (constructed in 1888, with subsequent additions) is a single-storey church building. The site was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 1998.

#### Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Annette Street Baptist Church is an institution of historical importance to the West Toronto Junction community. The area was developed in the 1880s after the Canadian Pacific Railway opened its West Toronto freight yard, which attracted industry, residential subdivisions, and institutions including churches. Following the incorporation of the Village of West Toronto in 1884 (which became the Town of West Toronto Junction, the Town of Toronto Junction and the City of West Toronto prior to its annexation by the City of Toronto in 1909), Annette Street Baptist Church opened in 1889 and served the spiritual and social interests of the community for nearly a century.

While Annette Street Baptist Church incorporates elements of the popular architectural styles of the late 1800s, particularly features from High Victorian Gothic Revival and Romanesque Revival, its overall character recalls the Arts and Crafts influences of the late 19th century. While local builder John Turner is credited with its construction, the design of Annette Street Baptist Church resembles one developed for small-scale churches by Toronto architect Edmund Burke and published in <u>The Canadian Baptist</u> magazine in 1886. The exaggerated pitch and flared eaves of the roof were retained in the design when the structure was extended to the west (1906), with the west entrance (1920) displaying complementary Arts and Crafts detailing.

Contextually, as a church placed on a corner lot at a major intersection in the neighbourhood, Annette Street Baptist Church is a landmark in the West Toronto community. It is an integral part of the collection of churches that contributes to the character of Annette Street as an institutional corridor where Annette Street Baptist Church is historically, visually and physically linked to its surroundings. 3 City of Toronto By-law No. 30-2011

#### Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 200 Annette Street are:

- The church building.
- The scale, form and massing of the rectangular plan that rises one extended storey above a stone base with window openings, the application of red brick cladding with brick, stone and wood detailing.
- The steeply-pitched gable roof with the flared eaves, gabled dormers and, at the northwest corner, an extended brick chimney.
- At the southwest and southeast ends, the corner towers with pyramidal roofs, flared eaves and, on the west tower, brick finials (which have been altered).
- The east tower (1888), which contains the original entrance to the church and has segmental-arched openings with decorative hood moulds.
- The round-arched openings, many of which are organized by brick buttresses and contain leaded glass windows.
- The distinctive round window on the west façade.
- On the west façade facing High Park Avenue, the single-storey entrance porch with its steeply-pitched gable roof with flared eaves, oversized wood brackets, half-timbering, and monumental round-arched entry.
- The datestone, labelled "A.D. 1888 & 1906" (at the base of the west tower).
- The placement and setback of the building on the corner lot

4 City of Toronto By-law No. 30-2011

#### SCHEDULE "B"

PIN 21360-0068 (LT)

LT 1-2 BLK 23 PL 553 WEST TORONTO JUNCTION EXCEPT CA539416 & CA726620

City of Toronto Province of Ontario Land Titles Division of the Toronto Registry Office (No. 66)

The hereinbefore described land being delineated by heavy outline on Sketch No. PS-2010-078 dated October 19, 2010, as set out in Schedule "C".
SCHEDULE "C" 281  $\odot$ 279 HIGH PARK AVENUE 277  $\odot$ PUBLIC LANE LS 275 0 273 ⊙ <sup>45.7m±</sup>  $\odot$  $\odot$  $\odot$ 21.3m±  $\odot$ ۳ ۳ (ANNETTE STREET BAPTIST CHURCH) 182 3 184 188 -¢ 45.7m ± •LSO П 0 0 0 ANNETTE STREET 0 4.5 181 187 0 193 185 183 195 201 189 791 265  $\odot$ **PROPERTY INFORMATION SHEET NO. 200 ANNETTE STREET** & MAPPING SER (ANNETTE STREET BAPTIST CHURCH) OTE: IS SKETCH IS NOT IS SKETCH IS NOT IS SKETCH IS NOT NO HAS BEEN COMPILED IOM SURVEY NOTES AND FICE RECORDS, IT SHALL OT BE USED EXCEPT FOR THE FURDES INDICATED THE TITLE BLOCK LAND DESIGNATED AS BEING OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE AND INTEREST (NOT TO SCALE) WARD 13 – PARKDALE-HIGH PARK DATE: OCTOBER 19, 2010 CHECKED BY: JOHN HOUSE SKETCH No. PS-2010-078 PREPARED BY: DWAYNE PITT

5 City of Toronto By-law No. 30-2011

### Appendix III: Designation By-law 0215-2009 for 152 Annette Street

Authority: Etobicoke York Community Council Item 21.5, as adopted by City of Toronto Council on December 1, 2 and 3, 2008 Enacted by Council: February 25, 2009

### CITY OF TORONTO

### BY-LAW No. 215-2009

# To designate the property at 152 Annette Street (Victoria Royce Church) as being of cultural heritage value or interest.

WHEREAS authority was granted by Council to designate the property at 152 Annette Street (Victoria Royce Church) as being of cultural heritage value or interest; and

WHEREAS the *Ontario Heritage Act* authorizes the Council of a municipality to enact by-laws to designate real property, including all the buildings and structures thereon, to be of cultural heritage value or interest; and

WHEREAS the Council of the City of Toronto has caused to be served upon the owners of the land and premises known as 152 Annette Street and upon the Ontario Heritage Trust, Notice of Intention to designate the property and has caused the Notice of Intention to be posted on the City's web site for a period of 30 days in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 162, Notice, Public, Article II, § 162-4, Notice requirements under the *Ontario Heritage Act*; and

WHEREAS the reasons for designation are set out in Schedule "A" to this by-law; and

WHEREAS no notice of objection was served upon the Clerk of the municipality;

The Council of the City of Toronto HEREBY ENACTS as follows:

- 1. The property at 152 Annette Street more particularly described in Schedule "B" and shown on Schedule "C" attached to this by-law, is designated as being of cultural heritage value or interest.
- 2. The City Solicitor is authorized to cause a copy of this by-law to be registered against the property described in Schedule "B" to this by-law in the proper Land Registry Office.
- **3.** The City Clerk is authorized to cause a copy of this by-law to be served upon the owners of the property at 152 Annette Street and upon the Ontario Heritage Trust and to cause notice of this by-law to be posted on the City's web site for a period of 30 days in accordance with Municipal Code Chapter 162, Notice, Public, Article II, § 162-4, Notice requirements under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

ENACTED AND PASSED this 25th day of February, A.D. 2009.

SANDRA BUSSIN,

Speaker

ULLI S. WATKISS City Clerk

(Corporate Seal)

2 City of Toronto By-law No. 215-2009

### SCHEDULE "A"

### **REASONS FOR DESIGNATION**

### Description

The property at 152 Annette Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of design, associative and contextual value. Located on the northwest corner of Annette Street and Medland Street, the building was completed in 1892 as West Toronto Junction Presbyterian Church. The site was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 1983.

### Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church is a well-designed example of the Romanesque Revival style, which was popular for religious and residential buildings in the late 19th century. Inspired by French and Spanish architecture from the 11th and 12th centuries, the revival style is recognized by its oversized round-arch motifs, rugged surfaces, and ornate detailing. Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church is distinguished by its corner tower and the decorative brickwork, particularly the ogee designs and cross motifs that highlight the door and window openings.

Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church has associative value as an institution of importance to the community. In 1884, a Presbyterian congregation was organized in the West Toronto Junction, which worshipped in temporary quarters until a wood church was completed the next year. Following the construction of the current brick church in 1892, the edifice was renamed Victoria Presbyterian Church to commemorate Queen Victoria's Diamond Jubilee in 1897. The congregation amalgamated with Royce Avenue Presbyterian Church in 1969 and retained the Annette Street premises. Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church was closed in June 2006.

The church is also associated with the architectural partnership of Wilm Knox and John Elliot, who practiced in Toronto from 1888 to 1892. Knox, who trained as an architect in his native Scotland, and the Canadian-born Elliot had previously worked for the notable Chicago architectural firm of Burnham and Root, whose early projects embodied the popular Romanesque Revival style (known in the United States as Richardsonian Romanesque). In Toronto, Knox and Elliot (in association with local architect Beaumont Jarvis) employed a Romanesque Revival design to win a prestigious competition for the Confederation Life Company's headquarters. This highly publicized commission led to others, including the West Toronto Junction Presbyterian Church. The church was one of the last projects in Toronto completed by Knox and Elliot, who returned to Chicago for the World's Columbian Exhibition.

Contextually, Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church is a neighbourhood landmark at the northwest corner of Annette Street and Medland Street in West Toronto. It contributes to Annette Street where a series of church complexes line the boulevard. Among the group, Keele Street Church of Christ (1890) at 99 Annette, Annette Street Baptist Church (1888) at 200 Annette, and High Park-Alhambra United Church (1908) at 260 High Park Avenue (at the southwest corner of Annette Street) are also recognized on the City's heritage inventory.

# E B A

3 City of Toronto By-law No. 215-2009

### Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of Victoria-Royce Presbyterian Church associated with its cultural heritage value as a well-designed late 19th century church with Romanesque Revival styling that is a neighbourhood landmark are:

- The scale, form and massing.
- The red brick cladding with brick, stone, wood, copper and glass trim.
- The near-square plan, rising one extended storey above a raised base with window openings.
- The steeply-pitched cross-gable roof.
- Under the cross-gables on the south, east and north facades, the oversized round-arched tripartite window openings with voussoirs and hood moulds, where the large central openings are flanked by smaller versions.
- At the southeast corner, the square tower with the steeply-pitched hipped spire with gabled dormers, the round-arched window openings, the corbelled brickwork, and the Classical detailing.
- At the base of the tower, the south and east entrances where paired wood doors and transoms with leaded glass are placed in oversized round-arched openings.
- On the east façade, the secondary entrance (north) that is placed in the segmental-arched surround with brick detailing.
- On the south façade, the gable-roofed entrance porch (west) that is placed beneath the trio of diminutive flat-headed window openings with a continuous stone label and sill.
- The west elevation, with a round window opening beneath the apex of the gable.
- The leaded glass in some of the window openings.
- At the northwest corner of the church, the Sunday School building with the three-storey plan and flat roof, the red brick cladding with stone trim, the pedimented east façade, the flat-headed window openings, and the entrance porch (east) with Arts and Crafts detailing.

The interior with the hammer beam roof is not included in the Reasons for Designation.

4 City of Toronto By-law No. 215-2009

### SCHEDULE "B"

Part of PIN 21360-0248 (LT)

Parts of Lots 3, 4 and 5 in Block 24 on Plan 553 West Toronto Junction designated as PART 1 on Plan 66R-24116 Saving And Excepting thereout and therefrom PART 2 on Plan 63R-2203

City of Toronto and Province of Ontario Land Titles Division of the Toronto Registry Office (No. 66)

The hereinbefore described land being delineated by heavy outline on Sketch No. PS-2009-021 dated February 9, 2009, as set out in Schedule "C".



5 City of Toronto By-law No. 215-2009

## Appendix IV: Description of Burke, Horwood and White (the Canadian Encyclopedia)

The Canadian Encyclopedia describes the architecture firm as:

"The Toronto architectural firm of Burke, Horwood and White was founded in 1894 by Edmund Burke (b at Toronto 31 Oct 1850; d at Toronto 2 Jan 1919) and J.C.B. Horwood (b at Quidi Vidi, Newfoundland 19 Mar 1864; d at Toronto 1938). Burke had been a partner in the firm Langley and Burke from 1873 to 1892, and practiced on his own in 1892-94. Horwood apprenticed with Langley and Burke before working in New York for several years. Murray White (b at Woodstock 5 Aug 1869; d at Toronto 3 Nov 1935), who also apprenticed with Langley and Burke, worked in Chicago from 1892 to 1907, and did not join Burke and Horwood until 1909.

Burke and Horwood's first important commission was the rebuilding of the Robert Simpson store in Toronto. Burke had executed the original store in 1894, but it burnt down within weeks of opening. Horwood had gained experience with the most advanced building methods in New York, and Simpson hired the new partnership to design a new fire-proofed store in 1895-96. The store's façade presented the grid-like pattern of the Chicago style, with only limited ornamentation on the ground floor and cornice. The original store and its replacement were likely the first Canadian application of curtain wall construction.

Burke, Horwood and White were one of the most successful Canadian architectural firms during the boom decades preceding World War I. The firm was commissioned to design many churches across the country; other important institutional clients included the YMCA and Mt Allison University in New Brunswick. The firm also produced many substantial homes for wealthy clients in Ontario and the Maritimes.

Burke, Horwood and White were known for their commercial buildings, and this led to the firm's appointment as architects to the Hudson's Bay Company. Large, classical department stores were built in Calgary, Vancouver and Victoria, 1912-26. Burke also consulted on civic planning for Toronto, such as the architectural aspects of the Bloor Street viaduct. Though the firm designed buildings in various historical styles, its projects also utilized modern materials and methods of construction, such as glazed terra cotta, early iron and reinforced concrete frames, and forms of fire protection. During this period buildings became increasingly large and complex, and their design required more specialized knowledge. Burke always researched advances in technology, building programming, and design, and shared his knowledge with colleagues in the form of lectures and publications. In the words of his biographer, Burke "presided over the transformation of the architect from craftsman to consulting professional.

Indeed, both Burke and Horwood were active among professional architectural societies. In particular, Burke served as president of the Ontario Association of Architects four times, and was the founding vicepresident of the Royal Architectural Institute of Canada.

The firm was renamed Horwood and White in 1919 after Burke's death, and existed under that name until 1969. After the deaths of the latter two partners the firm was run by Horwood's son, Eric C. Horwood (1900-84). In 1979, Eric Horwood donated to the Archives of Ontario over a century's worth of architectural drawings done by Burke, Horwood and White, and by many of their predecessor firms such as Langley and Burke."

3

### Appendix V: By-law No. 23-75

1.4



Roy V. Henderson / City Clerk

A.R.N. Woadden / Deputy City Clerk

Records and Archives Division

R. Scott James/City Archivist 367-7042

Department of the City Clerk City Hall, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5H 2N2

March 9, 1977

### Dear Sir:

I enclose copy of Order of the Ontario Municipal Board dated January 31, 1977 approving Restricted Area By-law No. 23-75.

Yours truly U City Archivist

:w

Copies to: Buildings Commissioner (2) Commissioner of Development Toronto Assessment Commissioner City Surveyor Secretary-Treasurer, Committee of Adjustment City of Toronto Planning Board Commissioner of Public Works Mr. W. Pryce

4 1 1 4 -Department CITY OF TORONTO ILLIAM P. CALLOW, Q.C. LV. SAWYER MICHAEL E. FRAM, G.C. DAVID C. LYONS, Q.C. City Hall Toronto M5H 2N2 Please reply attention of: Mr. W. V. Hawryliw Telephone: 367-7237 March 7, 1977. City Hall. Dear Sir: Re: <u>By-law No. 23-75</u> I enclose herewith duplicate original and eight empies of an Order dated January 31st, 1977 of the Ontario Municipal Board approving By-law No. 23-75. Please place the original Ort Roy V. Henderson, Esc., City Clerk, 2nd Floor, City Hall. 26886 Please place the original Order with the original By-law in your possession. Yours truly, City Solicitor 1111 WVH:el Enclosures

ER

. . e . R 751383 Ontario Municipal Board IN THE MATTER OF Section 35 of The Planning Act (R.S.O. 1970, c. 349), - and -IN THE MATTER OF an application by The Corporation of the City of Toronto for approval of its Restricted Area By-law 23-75 BEFORE A. H. ARRELL, Q.C., Monday, the 31st day Vice-Chairman - and of January, 1977 W. E. DYER, Q.C., Member THIS APPLICATION having come on for public hearing on the 2nd day of December, 1975 at the City of Toronto and after the hearing of the application the Board having reserved its decision until this day; THE BOARD ORDERS that By-law 23-75 is hereby approved. S. Undur C. K. C. ANDREWS SECRETARY ENTERED 0. B. No. R.75-6 FEB 25 19/1 Alludy C.



#### No. 23-75. A BY-LAW

To amend By-law No. 20623 so as to parmit a home for elderly parsons at the south-west corner of Annette Street and High Park Avenue.

[Passed February 6, 1975.]

The Council of The Corporation of the City of Toronto enacts as follows:

1. None of the provisions of subsections (3), (4), (5), (12) and (13) of section 4 and of section 8 of By-law No. 20523 being "A By-law To regulate the use of and the erection, use, bulk, height, spacing of and other matters relating to buildings and structures and to prohibit certain uses of lands and the crection and use of certain buildings and structures in various areas of the City of Toronto", shall apply to the section or use as a home for elderly persons of an addition to the church on the lot hereinafter described or the use of the church on the same lot, provided:

- the lot upon which the addition is erected and the church located comprises at least the lands hereinafter described;
- (2) no part of such addition above grads is located otherwise than wholly within the area delineated by heavy lines on the Plan attached to and forming part of this By-law;
- (3) the gross floor area above grads of both the church and additions together do not exceed 1.0 times the lot area;
- (4) a total of 98 one bedroom suites are provided within the addition for the purposes of accommodating elderly persons;
- (5) the owner provides and maintains a continuous driveway over the lot from the west limit of High Park Avenue to the south limit of Annette Street as indicated on the Plan, a door of the addition adjacent to the driveway, and a sign at both the entrance and exit of the driveway indicating that it provides a continuous route from High Park Avenue to Annette Street;
- (6) the owner provides and maintains 15 parking spaces on a hard surfaced area to be located as indicated on the Plan, notwithstanding any provision to the contrary in the aforesaid By-law No. 20623;
- (7) such addition exclusive of the mechanical penthouse does not exceed a height of 62 feet above grade;
- (8) landscaped open space is provided and maintained at least to the extent of 33 per cent. of the area of the lot;

10

E B A

2

:

(9) the addition is at least 22 feet from the westerly lot line and 25 feet from the southerly lot line;

2

(10) a fence 5 feet 6 inches in height is constructed of either brick or decorative wood along the interior lot lines;

The following is a description of the lot referred to above, namely:

The following is a description of the lot referred to above, namely: The following is a description of the lot referred to above, namely: Premising that the bearings herein are astronomic and are referred to the southerly limit of Annette Street assumed to be on a course of North 74 degrees 00 minutes and 00 seconds East as shown on Registered Plan 553-York, then; commencing at the north-exaterly angle of lot 1 according to registered plan 795-York; thenge South 16 degrees 13 minutes and 10 seconds East along the easterly limits of lots 1, 2, 3 and 4 according to the said plan 795-York; being along the westerly limit of High Park Avenue, a distance of 199,14 feet more or less to the south-easterly angle of the said lot 3, thence South 74 degrees 01 minute and 40 seconds West along the south-erly limit of the suble south-easterly angle of the said lot 3, thence south 74 degrees 01 minute and 40 seconds West along the south-erly limit of the said lot 4 a distance of 145.20 feet; thence South 16 degrees 35 minutes and 20 seconds East 50.00 feet more or less to a point in the southerly limit of lot 15 according to registered plan 533-York, distant 142.30 feet measured westerly thereon from the south-easterly angle thereof; thence South 16 degrees 20 minutes and 35 seconds East 50.17 feet more or loss to a point in the southerly limit of 14 according to the said plan 553-York distant 54.20 feet measured easterly thereon from the south-westerly angle thereof; thence South 16 degrees 22 minutes and 00 seconds West along the westerly limits of the said lots 14, 15, 4, 3, 2 and 1 a distance of 239.72 feet more or less to the south-westerly angle of the said lot 1; thence North 174 degrees 00 minutes and 00 seconds East along the ontherly limit of the said lot 1, being along the southerly limit of Annette Street, a distance of 199.74 feet more or less to the point of commence met. The aforementioned plans being registered in the formere Registry Office for the Registry Division of Toronto

2. The owner shall enter into an agreement or agreements with The Corporation of the City of Toronto dealing with the provision, maintenance and use of the driveway, parking spaces and fence as required under section 1.

3. The driveway, parking spaces and fence covered by the agreement or agreements referred to in section 2 shall be provided and maintained by the owner at his sole risk and expense and to the

3

satisfaction of the said Corporation of the City of Toronto and in default thereof the provisions of section 469 of *The Municipal Act*, R.S.O. 1970, Chapter 284, shall apply.

No building permit shall issue until the agreement or agreements referred to in section 2 have been entered into.

ments referred to in section 2 have been entered into. 5. The definitions of the words "grade", "fot" and "parking space" contained in the aforesald Bylaw No. 20632 shall apply to the said words when used in this Bylaw, and the words "gross floor area" shall also beer the same definition as contained in paragraph (c) of subsection (12) of section 4 of the said Bylaw No. 20632 except that the gross floor area of the addition and church may be calculated with-out including therein the area of any floor below grade, of any recrea-tional space or of the penthouse containing mechanical, electrical and ventilation equipment.

6. This py-law shall not come into force without the approval of the Ontario Municipal/Board.

ARTHUR C Red Leton, Irosiding Officer.

Key V. Jenderso ROY V. HENDERSON, Deputy City Clork.

Toronto, February 6, 1975. (L.S.)



÷

:



.

Ξ.